



Cade Sterling <csterling@cityofevanston.org>

1210 Maple revised design

Martha Stockton [REDACTED]
To: Cade Sterling <csterling@cityofevanston.org>
Cc: John Tuzson [REDACTED]

Fri, Jul 8, 2022 at 2:34 PM

Hello Cade,
Thanks for letting me know about the packet. Can you please relay the following to the commission?
Thanks,
Martha

Dear Members of the Commission,

My father and I live at 1220 Maple, and I am an architect with a background in preservation.

We reviewed the revised plans for this proposed house. I appreciate the illustrations used and care taken to show the attention to each of the compatibility requirements as well as the changes made to ensure that the house upholds the strong character of the 1200 block of Maple Avenue.

I am more comfortable with this design than the previous version. In particular, I appreciate the following changes:

1. The raising of the first floor level. It is still lower than the other houses', but it helps it to relate, and it requires an entry stair which then mimics the entry sequence for the other houses.
2. The continuous porch and roof on the front of the house, aligned with the adjacent houses vertically and horizontally. As discussed, this porch "layer" is such a major feature of the block, creating a semi-private space between the sidewalk and the house.
3. The wall on the side of the porch, which reflects the height of the adjacent porch and encloses the porch, which is otherwise open.

Given the above, I still have a couple of suggestions that I feel would increase the compatibility of the design, though I understand it is not my design nor my house:

1. I would love to see the top of that dark "bay window" element on the front become a gable end, something that is not alien to modern design. The majority of the houses on the block have some gable end shape facing the street, and this would be one more element that a modern house could share with its neighbors. There are gables on every other elevation of the house, so I'm not sure why one couldn't be added here.
2. I'd also like to see the porch roof sloped down towards the street. It is not incompatible with modern design (the original design had a sloped porch roof). This would continue the porch roof line from the other houses. Though structurally I can see the reason for it to be flat and cantilevered out from the floor joists, if columns are not desired.

The metal roofing is not used anywhere else on the block, but as it is a more durable, more energy efficient material than asphalt shingles, I don't strongly object to it, if the house is compatible in other ways.

I appreciate the commission's attention to this proposal as well as the architect and our new neighbor's efforts to keep Maple Avenue the very special architectural space that it is. I trust that the commission will make the correct judgement on the extent to which the house needs to share design principles and elements with the neighboring houses.

Best,
Martha Tuzson Stockton
1220 Maple Avenue



Cade Sterling <csterling@cityofevanston.org>

1219 MapleAve

Jean Cunningham [REDACTED]
To: csterling@cityofevanston.org
Cc: Alan Riggs [REDACTED]

Fri, Jul 8, 2022 at 2:05 PM

M. Sterling,
My husband, Alan Riggs, and I live at 1246 Maple Ave, Evanston IL. After reviewing the packet for proposed 1210 Maple construction, we support building this home on our street. As in many Evanston neighborhoods, there are modern homes interspersed w traditional designs. This home is a very nice complement and very thoughtful consideration of shapes and dimensions of neighboring homes.

We are highly supportive of adding homes of high energy efficiency which this is one. We need to remove barriers to improving our environmental footprint.

I look forward to welcoming our new neighbor who shows such commitment to environment and sensitivity to neighborhood.

Jean Cunningham

Sent from my iPhone
[REDACTED]

From: "Richard C. Gleason" [REDACTED]
Date: June 27, 2022 at 5:50:22 PM CDT
To: Hana Herrick [REDACTED]
Subject: Re: 1210 letter of support

To the the Members of the Preservation Committee:

I have lived at 1213 Oak in Evanston for some 44 years. I write in support of the new home planned for 1210 Maple. As far as I can tell no one doubts that the new owner of this property will comply with every Evanston building and zoning requirement. I believe objections to her plans for her new home to be specious and unwarranted. I have read the Preservation Commission's notices and intended purposes. The new owner is not changing any landmark home or structure. She has purchased a full lot. There are any number of homes and residences in this so-called historic district that bear Striking differences to other homes on the same block or even next door. There are single-family homes next to multi family structures, from apartment buildings to two flats.

Some of the homes, including the one I have lived in for 44 years, have undergone significant changes not only to the residences itself but to structures surrounding them. There are multi use units, there are small homes, there are larger homes.

The idea of requiring a new home to look exactly like other older homes or to fit into some stylized model to me is preposterous. This home is going to enhance our neighborhood. It is going to improve Evanston's tax base.

Who is to say that the planned design for 1210 Maple will not be better appreciated or more popular than the subjective evaluations or current opinions of people now.

I urge the commission to approve the architect's design and the new owner's proposed home. We should be welcoming our neighbor and expressing our appreciation for her wanting to live in our community.

Anyone who reads the intent of the preservation commission can plainly see that it pertains predominantly to changing the exteriors of existing structures. This new home does not do any of that.

Richard C. Gleason

1213 Oak Avenue

Evanston, Illinois 60202

[REDACTED]

IMPORTANT NOTICES

Never trust wiring instructions sent via email. Cyber criminals are hacking email accounts and sending emails with fake wiring instructions. These emails are convincing and sophisticated. **Always** independently confirm wiring instructions in person or via a telephone call to a trusted and verified phone number. **Never** wire money without double-checking that the wiring instructions are correct. By opening this e-mail, you agree that you understand the risks of hacking and agree that At World Properties LLC shall have no liability for the wiring of funds. This email message is for the sole use of the intended recipient(s) and may contain confidential and privileged information. Any unauthorized review, use, disclosure or distribution is strictly prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient, contact the sender via reply email and destroy all copies of the original message. Although At World Properties LLC takes reasonable measures to prevent the transmission of computer viruses, by opening this email you agree that At World Properties LLC shall have no liability for any loss or damage caused by this email.

Mon, Jul 11, 2022 at 8:39 AM



Cade Sterling <csterling@cityofevanston.org>

1210 Maple revised drawings

2 messages

Jeff Hickey [REDACTED]
To: Cade Sterling <csterling@cityofevanston.org>

Sun, Jul 10, 2022 at 6:09 PM

Dear Mr. Sterling and Landmark Commission Members,

Thank you for the link to the revised rendering of the proposed new construction at 1210 Maple Ave. Since we are not able to attend the July 12 hearing we are sending our responses and ask that they be entered into the record.

We appreciate the architect's efforts to incorporate some of the design features of particular concern to some of the Maple Ave. residents. We believe there is inherent tension in building a home with modern design elements on a street within a designated local and federal historic district that has many homes dating from the Victorian era, including four of which are local and federally designated landmarks.

The architect has made some positive design changes that attempt better integration with the surrounding homes, including the raised and lengthened porch and we applaud them. That said, we continue to have concerns regarding some elements of the design, particularly the east facade. The eave of the roof on the front of the house now shows a two story bay that interrupts the roof line. This is particularly jarring given the context of the surrounding properties. It was not in the drawing submitted for the June 14 hearing.

We can only imagine the challenges for the commission to find a solution that preserves the historical qualities of the 1200 block while respecting the wishes of the property owner. Unfortunately, we don't believe the current design is that solution.

Thank you for efforts.

Respectfully,

Jeff Hickey and Annette Rehmke
1227 Maple Ave.

Cade Sterling <csterling@cityofevanston.org>
To: Jeff Hickey [REDACTED]

Mon, Jul 11, 2022 at 8:38 AM

Thank you Jeff and Annette,

I will include your comments in the materials reviewed by the Commission.

Cade W. Sterling

Planner

Historic Preservation

City of Evanston

847-448-8231

Note: The contents of this electronic mail to/from any recipient hereto, any attachments hereto, and any associated metadata pertaining to this electronic mail, is subject to disclosure under the Illinois Freedom of Information Act, 5 ILCS 140/1 et. seq.

[Quoted text hidden]



Cade Sterling <csterling@cityofevanston.org>

1210 Maple Avenue Public Comment

Jessica Cooksey [REDACTED]
Reply-To: Jessica Cooksey [REDACTED]
To: "csterling@cityofevanston.org" <csterling@cityofevanston.org>
[REDACTED]

Sun, Jul 10, 2022 at 10:07 PM

Dear Mr. Sterling and Members of the Preservation Commission,

We are writing regarding the proposed new construction at 1210 Maple Avenue.

We are the owners of the home next door, at 1208 Maple. Jessica grew up in Evanston. We have lived at our present address for the past 4 years.

We would like to reiterate that we welcome Margaret Stender to Evanston and to the 1200 block of Maple. We also welcome the addition of a home and a neighbor to the lot adjacent to our home.

We have reviewed the revised plans for this proposed house and appreciate the efforts that have been made to make the house more visually compatible with the block and the historic district. We, again, think the goal of creating an environmentally sustainable home is a laudable one. As the adult children of two sets of parents currently doing their best to age in place in Evanston, we also strongly support the endeavor to create a home that allows for aging in place. We, personally, have no objections to the formal aspects of the proposal. We very much appreciate the time and care you put into considering the proposals before you and have confidence in the Commission's process. We defer to the expertise of the Commission to provide guidance regarding the adherence of the proposed structure to the Commission's standards.

Best,

Jessica Cooksey
Nishant Verma
[1208 Maple Ave](#)
[Evanston, IL 60202](#)



Cade Sterling <csterling@cityofevanston.org>

Preservation Commission Public Comment Sign Up Form

noreply@formstack.com <noreply@formstack.com>
Reply-To: noreply@formstack.com
To: csterling@cityofevanston.org, cruiz@cityofevanston.org

Tue, Jul 12, 2022 at 5:01 PM



Formstack Submission For: **Preservation Commission Public Comment Sign Up Form**

Submitted at 07/12/22 5:01 PM

Name: L J ELLUL

Address: 1217 Maple Avenue

Phone:

Provide Written Comment Here: Good afternoon, Preservation Commission Members

I will be attending this meeting in person to convey my comments AGAINST the updated design for the modern-style home proposed for 1210 Maple Avenue. The new design appears largely unchanged in its fundamentals, pertaining to its lack of congruity with the surrounding homes. I ask that my comments below be included in the official record for this matter, which is listed as "Old Business" on this evening's (July 12th) agenda and coded as 22PRES-0081.

Items I expect to mention include:

(1) The home's front elevation from grade is UNCHANGED from the design offered at the June 2022 meeting. Meaning, there still is no porch in the new design that is in line with existing homes on the block. The new 3-D rendering attempts to visually obfuscate this with the addition of people shadows and plants, as well as a flowered planter half wall.

(2) The patio size and open front area remain UNCHANGED from the June 2022 design. While the new extended overhang attempts to address the lack of porch issue, the new design fails to add any columns or vertical structures that visually would indicate a porch that is compatible with existing homes on the block. The new 3-D rendering also seems to visually obfuscate this item by its attempt to create a more porch-like depth visual with the people shadows and plants and by the darkening of the horizontal front floor plate.

(3) There is no gable on the front facing – existing homes on the block have gables. This also was discussed at the June 2022 meeting.

(4) The porch roof should be extended and sloped toward the front (street view) to be more in line with neighboring homes.

(5) Metal roof is inconsistent with all other homes on the block.

(6) The asymmetry caused by the new dark siding around the front windows (1st and 2nd floors) is incongruent with the existing homes.

(7) The bay window on 2nd floor interrupts roof line when viewed in regard to surrounding homes.

While the sustainability elements of the proposed home are laudable, the material point is the design's congruity and harmony with the existing homes on this very special historic block.

Thank you for your attention and consideration of my comments.

L J Ellul, MBA, CFE, CAMS, CIPP/US
1217 Maple Avenue
July 12, 2022

**Agenda
Item (or
comment
on item
not on
the
agenda):**

22PRES-0081

**Position
on
Agenda
Item:**

Opposed

Copyright © 2022 Formstack, LLC. All rights reserved. This is a customer service email.

Formstack, [11671 Lantern Road, Suite 300, Fishers, IN 46038](https://www.formstack.com)



Cade Sterling <csterling@cityofevanston.org>

Preservation Commission Public Comment Sign Up Form

noreply@formstack.com <noreply@formstack.com>
Reply-To: noreply@formstack.com
To: csterling@cityofevanston.org, cruiz@cityofevanston.org

Tue, Jul 12, 2022 at 5:17 PM



Formstack Submission For: **Preservation Commission Public Comment Sign Up Form**

Submitted at 07/12/22 5:17 PM

Name: Peter Siegal
Address: 1217 Maple Avnue
Phone: [REDACTED]

Provide Written Comment Here:

Following the very specific comments from the initial hearing concerning the appropriateness of this design for location among the historic homes on this block, I'm offended by the lip service offered in response. This design still is entirely out of character for this site. There appears to have been no effort to address fundamental incongruities: misaligned front porch/entry, alien roof form and material, bold geometric features without precedent on this block, and nothing offered to address the front porch. While direct advice was offered by the commission to rationalize the contemporary idiom of the design by use of idealized precedents, the design remains with little to no relationship to its neighbors. This point is made by the applicant by renderings meant to show relationships but with the opposite results: colored lines intended to show similarities lacking the discipline of shared points of origin. Further, the renderings represent trickery. The front plinth or porch has been darkened to trick us to believe the elevation has been raised to address its' neighbors when clearly it remains as originally presented. The entry canopy has been projected forward in an failed attempt to relate to the other houses on the block. It only shows how alien this element is to other front porches; a significant feature defining the other homes on this block.

Please try again. I'm sure a home more respectful of its' context can be offered.

Thank you!
Peter

Agenda 1210 Maple Avenue

**Item (or
comment
on item
not on
the
agenda):**

**Position
on
Agenda
Item:**

Opposed

[Quoted text hidden]