



**MEETING MINUTES**

**PRESERVATION COMMISSION**

Tuesday, May 9, 2023  
7:00 P.M.

Members Present: Beth Bodan, Carl Klein, Sarah Dreller, Suzi Reinhold, Jamie Morris, Aleca Sullivan, and Amanda Ziehm.

Members Absent: Stuart Cohen, John Jacobs

Staff Present: Cade W. Sterling

Presiding Member: Sarah M. Dreller, Chair

Minutes Taken by: Cade W. Sterling

---

**CALL TO ORDER / DECLARATION OF A QUORUM**

- The meeting was called to order with a quorum of seven members being present.

**PRESENTATIONS**

A. **Evanston Rebuilding Exchange**

Representatives from the Evanston Rebuilding Exchange shall present an overview of their operations, the value of deconstruction and salvaged materials, and how these efforts align with the Commissions goals and objectives.

- Aina Gutierrez, executive director, provided an overview of the Rebuilding Exchanges operations and services they offer including full and partial deconstruction, job training, and salvage and re-sale of materials.
- Aina emphasized the intersection of the Commission's work and her own including how deconstruction and salvaged materials contribute to sustainability and debris diversion, workforce development, more affordable and higher quality building material stock, and environmental benefits as compared to demolition including improved air quality and noise mitigation. 90% of materials from a deconstruction project are salvaged for re-use.
- Deconstruction and operations similar to the rebuilding exchange are

growing opportunities with more communities enacting public policy that supports this work as well as significant federal funding. Limitations include existing capacity, the need for more education and awareness surrounding why the work is important and how it contributes toward meaningful advancement of the City's economic development, climate resilience, affordability, and preservation goals, and the cost difference between deconstruction and demolition.

- Commissioners discussed other municipalities that have enacted deconstruction ordinances such as San Antonio, which is unique as it is housed within the Office of Historic Preservation, and Portland, which has one of the most expansive programs.
- Commissioners discussed abatement of salvaged materials that contain hazardous coatings such as lead paint. These materials are often discarded due to the cost and effort associated with remediation. All members of the deconstruction team are certified by the EPA to remove and abate lead paint. In many instances the materials could be removed and encapsulated, but in other situations these materials are discarded. Windows are most frequent.
- Architects in the room were asked to give any thoughts or insight into deconstruction and if they've used it in the past. Two individuals spoke. One had used deconstruction in the past, but noted it was often a cost and capacity issue that prevented it from becoming more common as well as bring costs down. The second member had not used deconstruction, but acknowledged he did not know that the Rebuilding Exchange offered these services, and that they could be used for partial deconstruction only, such as for a kitchen remodel, as a more environmentally conscious decision.

## NEW BUSINESS

### A. 1221 Hinman Ave - Landmark - Lakeshore Hist. Dist. - 23PRES-0064

Shumaker Design + Build Associates, applicant and architect, submit for a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a single-story rear addition below an existing projecting second story, construct a single-story greenhouse addition at the rear volume; alter the structures rear-volume fenestration and roof form at an existing non-original rear addition; demolish a non-original rear deck and stair, construct a new raised deck at the homes rear elevation; demolish an existing detached garage and construct a new single-story detached garage in the rear-yard.

**Applicable Standards:** Demolition [1-5]; Alteration [1-10]; and Construction [1-8, and 10-15].

- Garry Shumaker, architect, presented an overview of the proposal including a desire to modify previous non-sympathetic additions to better compliment the homes composition and form.
- All original windows will be restored.
- The existing garage will be demolished and replaced with a new detached garage of similar size that better compliments the roof form and detailing found on the home.
- There will be proposed solar panels on the homes east roof face although due to the slope, they are minimally visible. This area

allows for 21 of the recommended 28 panels necessary to offset energy costs.

- A motion to approve as presented was made by Commissioner Reinhold, seconded by Commissioner Klein, and carried unanimously.

**B. 833 Michigan Avenue - Lakeshore Historic District - 23PRES-0067**

Kaufman O'Neil, applicant and architect, submit for a Certificate of Appropriateness to enclose an existing screen porch, and construct a new one-story addition and screen porch at the homes rear volume.

**Applicable Standards:** Alteration [1-10]; and Construction [1-8, and 10-15]

- Tim Oneil, following a short introduction by the homeowners, presented an overview of the project which is limited in scope to a small enclosure of an open side porch, and the existing screen porch, and construction of a new screen porch off the kitchen.
- These exterior improvements are necessary to make the internal circulation and floor plan function for a larger family.
- The addition is modest in size, and subordinate to the principle structure while maintaining complimentary form and materiality.
- The principle structure is currently clad in aluminum siding. The proposed cladding for the addition will be fiber cement lap siding of similar exposure.
- Commissioners asked about the clipped corner detail at the addition and whether it does or could better mimic the geometry of clipped gable bay at the front of the home. The architect stated they explored using the same angle of the front bay but it created a loss in functional space for the already modest addition.
- A motion to approve as presented was made by Commissioner Klein seconded by Commissioner Sullivan, and carried unanimously.

**C. 1323 Elmwood Avenue - Landmark - 23PRES-0068**

Shawn Casey, owner and applicant, submits for a Certificate of Appropriateness to alter the homes roofing material from cedar shingle to asphalt shingle.

**Applicable Standards:** Alteration [1-10]

- Shawn Casey, presented an overview of the proposal including difficulty obtaining insurance for the home with the roof in its current state, and multiple contractors identifying problems with the roofs sheathing that create air-flow issues with installation of cedar shingles that will create more rapid deterioration and rot – limiting the lifecycle of the material that is already not much longer than asphalt.
- Three alternative asphalt shingles were presented, and applicant was receptive to use of any one of them. The applicant wants to respect the integrity of the home, but the cost of replacing in cedar, with the challenges of the existing sheathing, and a comparable

lifecycle make it infeasible for him.

- Alternative roofing materials that better simulate a cedar shingle were explored but were significantly higher in cost and availability.
- The applicant referred to the vernacular nature of the home, being landmarked for its ability to represent building types and forms once common throughout the City. He feels it will still be able to communicate that history with a change in roofing material. The roof faces are also not prominent, and the wood shingle in the gable ends and other more prominent detailing will remain.
- A motion to approve the proposal with the condition that City Staff review and select on-site the most compatible asphalt shingle, with special attention to edge thickness was made by Commissioner Bodan, seconded by Commissioner Sullivan, and carried unanimously.

## **APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES**

### **A. Minutes of April 11**

- The minutes were approved as presented with no revisions.

## **DISCUSSION (NO VOTE WILL BE TAKEN)**

### **A. Chicago Avenue Multimodal Corridor Improvements**

In accordance with Code Section 2-8-3 (G) 24. and Article 8 of the Commissions Rules and Procedures, the Commission is afforded the opportunity to review and comment on City projects or activities affecting landmarks or districts, or areas, properties, structures, sites or objects eligible for designation as landmarks or districts.

The Public Works Agency will present portions of the Chicago Avenue Multimodal Corridor Improvement Project proposed within or adjacent to the Lakeshore Historic District.

- Representatives from the City's Public Works Agency, and Tim Gustafson, lead consultant on the project, presented an overview of the Chicago Avenue Multi-Modal Improvement Project.
- The team presented improvements within the entire corridor, with special emphasis on portions which intersect or are adjacent to the Lakeshore Historic District, as well as portions adjacent to properties determined Landmark Eligible by the Commission.
- The District boundary crosses to the west side of Chicago Avenue in only one location, to include the Music Institute of Chicago, the former First Church of Christ Scientists, and the Lake Street Church, both Evanston Landmarks.
- Commissioners asked about the scope of the project. Members of the project team explained it was within the existing right-of-way and the existing curb. The width of the current travel lanes are being reduced to accommodate additional protected bike lanes, and bus boarding areas, as well as expanded sidewalks in some locations.

- Lighting was discussed, and will follow the City's street light standards with the Talmadge replicas and davit arm (more light output).
- Streetscape materials were discussed. It will following the City's standard streetscape material pallet with brick pavers, concrete sidewalks, and tree grates.
- The Commission found no adverse impacts to the Lakeshore Historic Districts integrity of setting, nor to the integrity of existing Landmark structures, or structures identified as being eligible for designation through prior survey projects, primarily on the west side of Chicago Avenue between Lake Street and Davis Street.
- The Commission generally applauded the project and its ability to create a complete street network from Chicago to Wilmette. Commissioners expressed a desire to accomplish something similar for the City's east-west routes.