



MEETING MINUTES

PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Tuesday, July 11, 2023
7:00 P.M.

Members Present: Beth Bodan, Carl Klein, Sarah Dreler, John Jacobs, Stuart Cohen
Amanda Ziehm, Susan Reinhold, Joshua Bowes-Carlson

Members Absent: Jamie Morris, Aleca Sullivan

Staff Present: Cade W. Sterling

Presiding Member: Sarah M. Dreler, Chair

Minutes Taken by: Cade W. Sterling

CALL TO ORDER / DECLARATION OF A QUORUM

- The meeting was called to order with a quorum of eight members being present.

OLD BUSINESS

A. **1404 Judson Ave - Landmark - LHD - 23PRES-0098**

Errol Kirsch, applicant and architect, submits for a Certificate of Appropriateness to alter the homes north elevation fenestration, construct a single-story addition and covered basement entryway at the rear volume of the homes north elevation. The applicant further requests the following Major Zoning Variations to expand a non-conforming structure as it relates to bulk (Code Section 6-6-5-2): a rear-yard setback of 3.75' where 30' is required and the existing legally non-conforming condition is 2.75' (Code Section 6-8-2-8 (A) 4); and building lot coverage of 33.25% where 30% is the maximum permitted and 31% is the existing legally non-conforming condition (Code Section 6-8-2-7). The Preservation Commission is the determining body for the Certificate of Appropriateness (Code Section 2-8-8). The Preservation Commission may, at its discretion, make a recommendation to the Land Use Commission, the determining body for the proposed zoning relief (Code Section 2-19-4 (E)).

- Commissioner Klein made a motion to continue this matter to the September 12 meeting of the Preservation Commission to allow the applicant additional time to revise his proposal and get approval from the State Historic Preservation Office. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Reinhold and adopted unanimously.

NEW BUSINESS

A. 1423 Judson Avenue - Lakeshore Historic District - 23PRES-0121

Thomas Ahleman, architect and applicant on behalf of the owner, submits for a Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish an existing uncovered wood deck in the rear-yard, alter the homes fenestration at the south, north, and east elevations of an existing rear volume two-story addition, and construct a new single-story addition to the homes rear volume.

- Thomas Ahleman presented a detailed overview of the proposal, the need for additional interior space, which catalyzed the project, and how many of the proposed detailing and forms relate to the existing structure and its design vocabulary.
- Mr. Ahleman explained the minor changes to window location in order to maximize the interior space and efficiency of space while reducing the overall mass of the proposed addition.
- Commissioner Jacobs asked the applicant about the proposed window material, manufacturer, and configuration.
 - The windows are Marvin Ultimate aluminum clad wood units with no divided lights. The casings for the new window openings will be wood with profiles to match existing. This matches the overall material choice for the cladding on the addition which is wood rather than fiber cement.
- Commissioner Reinhold made a motion for approval, seconded by Commissioner Cohen and carried unanimously.

B. 1126 Hinman Avenue - Lakeshore Historic District - 23PRES-0122

Thomas Ahleman, architect and applicant on behalf of the owner, submits for a Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish an existing uncovered wood deck and single-story entry addition at the homes rear volume, alter the homes west elevation fenestration, and construct a new single-story addition to the homes rear volume.

- Thomas Ahleman presented a detailed overview of the proposal including the desire to expand the homes interior space while being attentive to retaining the homes architectural character and materiality. The home has new owners who purchased the home due to its history, character, and location in a historic district.
- Materials are the same as on the home, which is primarily stucco. There was a desire to mimic the homes dramatic roof forms on the addition rather than introduce a new vocabulary. This required modification to the homes second-story fenestration, moving two windows further to the edges of the rear elevation, and eliminating a central bathroom window. Although the fenestration is changes, the second-story remains compatible in its pattern of fenestration to other elevations on the home. The homes bays were also replicated on the new rear elevation creating a harmonious composition.
- Commissioner Jacobs asked about the composite materials being used on the rear porch. The columns are a composite and would be painted, the material of the deck, railing, and balusters were not determined. After conferring with his client, Mr. Ahleman stated that these details would be wood.
- The dimension of the balusters would match the balusters on the front elevation porch.
- Commissioner Jacobs asked about the new Marvin Elevate windows (composite) and how the trim would transition with the stucco cladding. Mr. Ahleman stated they would match the existing profiles.
- Commissioner Cohen stated his approval of the deviation for the balusters on the rear

porch and creating more openness as compared to the front porch. He also stated conflict with the way the front and rear porches were supported where the front porch has less emphasis on the round columns than what is proposed at the rear, calling more attention to them – this effectively puts more emphasis on the point of entry and stair at the rear elevation. Overall Commissioner Cohen complimented the design and attention to the existing homes design vocabulary and materiality.

- Commissioner Bodan moved approval of the proposal as presented. Seconded by Commissioner by Commissioner Cohen and carried unanimously.

C. 2241 Sherman Avenue - Northeast Historic District - 23PRES-0125

Thomas Ahleman, architect and applicant on behalf of the owner, submits for a Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish an existing single-story addition and uncovered deck at the homes rear volume, alter the homes east elevation fenestration, and construct a new single-story addition and uncovered wood deck at the homes rear volume.

- Mr. Ahleman presented the proposed project, making special note that this was a project previously approved by the Commission as a much larger two-story gable addition. For a variety of reasons, including commentary by the Commission during that approval, the homeowners have decided to revisit the design and reduce its scale.
- The primary design challenge was how to integrate the vocabulary of the longer addition with the scale of the existing home. The revision does reduce bulk and mass from what was previously approved, but the challenge remained.
- All materials and detailing remain the same as the prior proposal including the Marvin aluminum clad wood windows. The prior screen porch became an enclosed sunroom in order to maximize interior space on a single-story where two-stories were previously proposed.
- Commissioners asked about the skylight in the upper-story bathroom, why it is off-center, and if it were possible to reduce its exposure above the roof line. Commissioners asked about the use of light tubes. Mr. Ahleman stated it would be reduced to the maximum extent possible and was off-center due to the location of the shower in the bathroom. Mr. Ahleman and Commissioners also noted that this would be minimally visible if one were standing in the alley – it is more visible on the drawings than in reality.
- Commissioner Reinhold stated that the roof forms and shapes and how they intersect are very complex, but there are no great solutions with the constraints that exist. It may not be the ideal solution, but it is one that meets the standards.
- Chair Dreler agreed with Commissioner Reinhold and further stated that this is a rear addition on a contributing structure in a location that is minimally visible.
- Commissioner Cohen stated that the form and expression of the rear addition is largely horizontal, including the relatively flat roof form. The verticality of the brick piers at the rear addition conflict with this and it may be a stronger composition if those were stucco. Mr. Ahleman didn't disagree but made reference to the brick piers elsewhere on the home.
- Commissioner Cohen made a motion to approve as presented. Seconded by Commissioner Ziehm and carried unanimously.
- Mr. Cohen complimented the applicant.

APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES

A. Minutes of June 13

- The minutes of June 13 were approved with an amendment to note Commissioner Reinholds absence.

DISCUSSION (NO VOTE WILL BE TAKEN)

A. Commissioner Candidate Search

Staff will provide an update on efforts by the Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion subcommittee to actively recruit new Commissioners with diverse backgrounds. Staff will also distribute recruitment flyers for community distribution.

- Mr. Sterling provided an update on the recruitment push, having identified over 100 individuals, organizations, and businesses to reach out to, including posting of physical flyers, information in the City's various newsletters, and other outreach efforts.
- There is currently one vacancy on the Commission with two more after the September meeting.
- The work by the subcommittee and City staff has been effective with many new applicants as well as many more interested in volunteering or applying in the future.

B. Historic Preservation Newsletter

Staff will provide an update on development of the quarterly historic preservation newsletter

- There are ~2800 subscribers to the Commissions agendas. The newsletter would be sent to this same group.
- Staff and the Commission discussed the upcoming newsletter, the first in ~30 years, that is scheduled to be released at the end of July. This was seen as an exciting opportunity, and Commissioners were asked to contribute content areas for the October newsletter under a variety of topics and regular columns that could be considered including:
 - Statement by the Chair
 - Partner Spotlight
 - Resource Spotlight
 - Meet a Commissioner (bio)
 - Then and Now (comparative photo)
 - Technical assistance corner